

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

GARY LIN, STEVE CRAWFORD, and  
FORREST SCHUCK individually and on  
behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 19-cv-11889  
Hon. Victoria A. Roberts

vs.

CRAIN COMMUNICATIONS, INC.,

Defendant.

---

HEDIN HALL LLP  
Frank S. Hedin  
David W. Hall  
1395 Brickell Ave., Suite 900  
Miami, FL 33131  
Tel: (305) 357-2107  
fhedin@hedinhall.com  
dhall@hedinhall.com

BURSOR & FISHER, P.A.  
Joseph I. Marchese  
Philip L. Fraietta  
888 Seventh Ave.  
New York, NY 10019  
Tel: (646) 837-7150  
jmarchese@bursor.com  
pfraietta@bursor.com

BARBAT, MANSOUR & SUCIU PLLC  
Nick Suciu III (P72052)  
1644 Bracken Rd.  
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48302  
Tel: (313) 303-3472  
nicksuciu@bmslawyers.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

---

HONIGMAN LLP  
J. Michael Huget (P39150)  
Jeffrey K. Lamb (P76738)  
Robert M. Riley (P72290)  
Jad Sheikali (IL Bar 6324641)  
2290 First National Building  
660 Woodward Ave.  
Detroit, MI 48226-3506  
Tel: (313) 465-7000  
mhuget@honigman.com  
jlamb@honigman.com  
rriley@honigman.com  
jsheikali@honigman.com

*Attorneys for Crain Communications, Inc.*

**STIPULATED ORDER REGARDING DISCOVERY DISPUTES AND  
SCHEDULE**

This matter is before the Court on the Stipulation of Plaintiffs and Defendant.

On December 1, 2020, the Court held a status conference, which resolved a number of discovery disputes;

Accordingly, the Court orders:

1. Plaintiffs' motion to compel production of documents responsive to Request for Production No. 2 is GRANTED. Defendant must produce all contracts and other agreements entered into between it and any other entity, including but not limited to data mining, data aggregation, data cooperative, marketing and publishing companies, including but not limited to Specialists Marketing Services, Inc., Acxiom Corporation, Experian Marketing Solutions, Inc., Wiland, Inc., Epsilon Data Management, LLC d/b/a Abacus Alliance, Dataline, Inc., Dunn Data Company, Direct Access Marketing Services, i-Behavior, Inc., Blue Hill Marketing Solutions d/b/a LiftEngine, and NextAction Cooperative, that pertain to the transmission of *Autoweek* magazine subscriber data during the time period of June 25, 2016 and July 30, 2016.

2. Plaintiffs' motion to compel a response to Interrogatory No. 5 is GRANTED. Defendant must identify all entities to which it transmitted *Autoweek* magazine subscriber data during the time period June 25, 2016 to July 30, 2016.

3. Plaintiffs' motion to compel production of litigation holds in response to Request for Production No. 20 is DENIED.

4. Defendant's motion for a protective order is GRANTED IN PART and DENIED IN PART. Specifically:

(a) Defendant must designate a representative to testify regarding Topics 4-12, but only as they pertain to the transmission or receipt of *Autoweek* magazine subscriber data during the time period of June 25, 2016 to July 30, 2016.

(b) Defendant must designate a representative to testify regarding Topics 13-15, to the extent those Topics relate to any enrollment by Plaintiffs in an *Autoweek* magazine subscription covering the time period June 25, 2016 to July 30, 2016, and to the extent information concerning past *Autoweek* subscriptions may have been disclosed during the time period June 25, 2016 to July 30, 2016, as reflected by records and information available to Crain.

(c) Defendant must designate a representative to testify regarding Topic 21, but only to the extent the underlying interrogatories relate to the claims of the individual named plaintiffs, with respect to *Autoweek* magazine, from the time period of June 25, 2016 to July 30, 2016.

(d) Defendant must designate a representative to testify regarding Topics 23-25, but only to the extent those Topics relate to nonprivileged communications, including communications with third parties regarding preservation obligations, if any, and only to the extent those Topics relate to

documents and information concerning *Autoweek* magazine and the time period June 25, 2016 to July 30, 2016.

5. Defendant must make its supplemental document production on or before January 5, 2021.

6. The deadline to complete Phase I discovery is extended through the close of business January 29, 2021.

Date: 12/29/2020

s/ Victoria A. Roberts  
HON. VICTORIA A. ROBERTS  
U.S. DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

STIPULATED:

/s/ Philip L. Fraietta  
Joseph I. Marchese  
Philip L. Fraietta  
Frank S. Hedin  
Nick Suciu III

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

/s/ Jeffrey K. Lamb  
J. Michael Huget  
Jeffrey K. Lamb  
Robert M. Riley

*Counsel for Defendant*